



FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume I

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2001 - 2002

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, Faith Teo,
Wendy Adams and Paul Broad

Storage

KE
538.5
.R64
2001
v.1
c.2

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

AUG 30 2001

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials


Volume I

Carol Rogerson and Martha Shaffer
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2001 - 2002

Prepared with the assistance of Ranald Sinclair, Ella Schwartz, Faith Teo,
Wendy Adams and Paul Broad

*These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto*



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

FAMILY LAW

Table of Contents

Volume I

Page No.

I. INTRODUCTION: THE FAMILY AND FAMILY LAW

A. The Family: Definitions and Demographics

Excerpts from Statutes and International Documents.....	1
Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada's Families</i>	2
<i>Moge v. Moge</i>	3
<i>Mossop v. Canada</i>	4
Barrett and McIntosh, <i>The Anti-Social Family</i>	4
Thorne, <i>Rethinking the Family: Some Feminist Questions</i>	5
La Novara, <i>A Portrait of Families in Canada</i>	7
Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada's Families</i>	9
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Family alive and well, study finds"	9
<i>Toronto Star</i> , " 'Typical' family has vanished, report says"	10
Baker, "Family Trends and Family Policies"	12
Drakich and Guberman, "Violence in the Family"	16

B. Legal Regulation of the Family

<i>Balfour v. Balfour</i>	22
Olsen, "The Family and the Market"	23
Minow, "Beyond State Intervention in the Family"	28
Eekelaar, <i>Family Law and Social Policy</i>	30
Glendon, <i>Abortion and Divorce in Western Law</i>	36

II. MARRIAGE AND NULLITY

A. The Significance of Marriage

Blackstone, <i>Commentaries on the Laws of England</i>	38
Cobbett, <i>Advice to Young Men and (incidentally) to Young Women</i>	38
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Canadian marriage rates go into dive"	39
Barr, <i>Basic Facts on Families in Canada</i>	40
Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada's Families</i>	40
Cox, "Alternative Families"	43
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i>	43

<i>Hyde v. Hyde</i>	44
<i>Graham v. Graham</i>	44
Day, “The Charter and Family Law”	47
Note: The Significance of Marriage for Aboriginal Women	48
Glendon, “The New Marriage and the New Property”	49

B. Unmarried Cohabitation

Note: Terminology	59
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Common-law gains cachet”	59
Holland, “Cohabitation and Marriage—A Meeting at the Crossroads?”	61
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i> , “Informal Family Relations”	66
Note: The Legislative Treatment of Unmarried Couples in Ontario	68
<i>Miron v. Trudel</i>	70
Note: Determining Whether Unmarried Persons are “Spouses”	75
<i>Molodowich v. Penttinen</i>	76
<i>Stoikiewicz v. Filas</i>	80
<i>Le Labbe and McCullough</i>	82
Ontario Law Reform Commission, <i>Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act</i> (1993)	84

C. Validity of Marriage

(a) Overview

Hahlo, “Nullity of Marriage in Canada”	87
Hovius, Note on Validity of Marriage	88
McLeod, “Validity of Marriage” from <i>Introduction to Family Law</i>	89

(b) Monogamy

Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Bigamy</i>	93
Note: Bigamous and Polygamous Relationships	94
<i>Lawyer’s Weekly</i> , “Polygamous spouses covered under B.C. family legislation, judge holds”	96
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Community practises polygamy”	98
<i>New York Times</i> , “My Husband’s Nine Wives”	100
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “France Moves to Stem Polygamy”	101
Note: Serial Polygamy	104

(c) Capacity to Consummate

<i>Gajamugan v. Gajamugan</i>	105
<i>Dashevsky v. Dashevsky</i>	107
<i>Norman v. Norman</i>	110

(d) Opposite Sexes

<i>B. v. A.</i>	112
<i>Layland v. Ontario</i>	118
Law, "Homosexuality and the Social Meaning of Gender"	124
Duclos, "An Argument for Legal Recognition of Same Sex Marriage"	125
Note: The "Registered Partnership" in Europe	127
Note: <i>Baehr v. Lewin</i>	128
Note: Same-Sex Couples and Extended Definitions of "Spouse"	129
<i>Anderson v. Luoma</i>	129
Note: Challenges to Benefits Programmes	132
<i>Mossop v. Canada</i>	132
<i>Egan v. Canada</i>	139
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Idea of extending benefits revived by Justice Minister"	147
Ontario Law Reform Commission, <i>Report on the Rights and Responsibilities of Cohabitants Under the Family Law Act</i> (1993)	148
Note: Ontario Bill 167	152
<i>M. v. H.</i>	153
Note: B.C. Same-Sex Legislation	163
Note: <i>Rosenberg v. Canada</i>	163

(e) Age Requirements for a Valid Marriage.....163

<i>The Guardian Weekly</i> , "Romantic Dilemma for Child Bride"	164
---	-----

(f) Consent as a Requirement for a Valid Marriage.....165**III DIVORCE****A. The Social Context of Divorce**

Barr, <i>Basic Facts on Families in Canada</i>	167
Payne, "The Dichotomy between Family Law and Family Crises on Marriage Breakdown"	168
Richards, "Divorcing Children: Roles for Parents and the State"	170

B. Reform of Divorce Law

(a) The Movement to No-Fault Divorce

Hahlo, "The Changing Face of Marriage and Divorce"	173
Abella, "Opening Address" in Sloss, ed., <i>Family Law in Canada</i>	176
Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Act</i>	179
Dept. Of Justice, <i>Evaluation of the Divorce Act</i>	182
Note: Divorce Reform in England	187

(b) Critiques of No-Fault Divorce

R.E.A.L. Women, "Easy Divorce?"	188
Weitzman, "Divorce and the Illusion of Equality"	190
Melli, "Constructing a Social Problem: The Post-Divorce Plight of Women and Children"	194
Note: Other Critiques of No-Fault Divorce	195
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Putting the 'fault' back in no-fault divorce"	200
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , "Spousal misconduct returns to divorce?"	202
Note: <i>Valenti v. Valenti</i>	205
Note: Tort of Emotional Distress	206

(c) Grounds for Divorce

(i) Living Separate and Apart

<i>Rushton v. Rushton</i>	209
<i>Dupere v. Dupere</i>	210
Note: Relevance of Date of Separation for Property Division under the <i>Family Law Act</i>	212
Note: Alternative to Separation as a "No-Fault" Ground for Divorce.....	212

(ii) Adultery

Bissett-Johnson and Day, <i>The New Divorce Law</i> , Definition of Adultery	213
Glendon, <i>The Transformation of Family Law</i>	213
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , "Wisconsin woman to stand trial on rarely used adultery charge"	214
<i>Lawyer's Weekly</i> , re Brazilian defence of honour	215
<i>Mastalerz v. Garland</i>	216
<i>Davenport v. Miller</i>	218

(iii) Cruelty

<i>Knoll v. Knoll</i>	221
<i>Austin v. Austin</i>	224
<i>Gilbert v. Gilbert</i>	225
<i>B.(Y.) v. B.(J.)</i>	229

(d) **Bars to Proceedings**(i) Condonation, Connivance, Collusion

Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , “Condonation”	231
<i>Guglielmo v. Mikhail (Lawyer’s Weekly)</i>	233
Davies, <i>Family Law in Canada</i> , “Connivance” and “Collusion”	234

(ii) Inadequate Provision for Child Support.....254(iii) Removal of Barriers to Religious Divorce

<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Ties that continue to bind”	237
<i>Globe and Mail</i> , “Religious laws to be removed as bargaining chip’ in divorces”	240

C. Institutional Reforms: Mediation

Landau, “Mediation: An Option for Divorcing Families”	241
Woods, “Mediation: A Backlash to Women’s Progress on Family Law Issues”	245
Payne and Overend, “Divorce Mediation: An Overview of Process and Strategies”	247

IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN**A. The Economics of Marriage**

Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada’s Families</i>	256
Statistics Canada, <i>Women in the Labour Force</i>	259
Note: 1995 Statistics on Women’s Labour Force Participation.....	261
Moller Okin, <i>Justice, Gender and the Family</i>	261
Gunderson, <i>Women and Labour Market Poverty</i>	262

B. The Economic Consequences of Divorce

Vanier Institute, <i>Profiling Canada’s Families</i>	265
<i>Willick v. Willick</i>	267

Note: Poverty Statistics for 1995	268
Rogerson, “Winning the Battle, Losing the War”	268
Note: Economic Consequences of Divorce	272
<i>Lawyers Weekly</i> , “Women suffer financially post-divorce while men benefit: Satscan study”	273
<i>Lawyers Weekly</i> , “Family law reform can’t solve divorce poverty?”	275